SPI 556e – Fall 2022   Professor Robert Hutchings
Thursday, 9:00 a.m. – 12:00 p.m.   415 Robertson Hall
020 Robertson Hall   Office Hours: Thursday, 1-3 p.m.
                                                                  hutchngs@princeton.edu

Strategic Intelligence and National Security Policy

This seminar examines the role of strategic intelligence in the making and implementation of national security policy, chiefly but not exclusively in the United States. In the first half of the course, we will explore theories of strategy and grand strategy and examine the evolution of the intelligence and national security systems. In the second half, we will focus on the analytic and political challenges of strategic intelligence. The course draws on the instructor's background at senior levels of the State Department, National Security Council, and National Intelligence Council to explore the complex relationship between intelligence and policy.

Assignments replicate such real-world challenges as proposing a new national security strategy for a U.S. president, advising a foreign leader on how to create a national security system, briefing an EU high representative on an intelligence study on the Middle East, and writing the "terms of reference" (i.e., background analysis and key questions) for a National Intelligence Estimate on Iran's nuclear program or China's "belt and road" initiative. The final paper will be in the form of a case study in strategic intelligence or a scenario analysis of the kind pioneered in the National Intelligence Council's pathbreaking "Global Trends" series. (One such topic might be "Russia, 2040"; another might be "What Future for NATO? Three Scenarios.")

Throughout the semester, we will follow current global issues as a "living laboratory," exploring breaking developments against the backdrop of our expanding body of conceptual and theoretical knowledge. Students are expected to stay abreast of key international developments and come to class prepared to discuss them from the perspectives of intelligence analyst or policy adviser.

Additional course information on attendance, academic integrity, academic resources, mental health resources, and disability accommodations is provided on pages 9 and 10 of this syllabus.

Assignments

Students will write two short policy memoranda, contribute to one group memo, make one formal oral presentation, and submit a final paper in the form of a case study or scenarios paper. Grades will be weighted roughly as follows: 35% for the three policy memos, 35% for the final paper, and 30% for the oral presentation and overall contributions to seminar discussions. There will be no exams.

Individual Policy Papers (20%) Students will write two brief policy papers of no more than 1,000 words each, based on assigned readings (i.e., with no additional research required):

➤ A memorandum for President Biden, proposing a new national security strategy to replace the March 2021 "Interim National Security Strategic Guidance," due week 3. (Students may opt instead to present a new national security strategy for a country other than the United States.)

➤ A memorandum for Chancellor Olaf Scholz, laying out the elements of a possible NSC (national security council) system for Germany, along with the pros and cons of adopting such a system, due week 6.

Group Assignments (15%) Students will be divided into three groups (A, B, and C) to prepare short memos of no more than 1,000 words and give in-class briefings. These assignments call for some additional research, which groups should apportion equitably among group members.

➤ Group A will prepare a memorandum for the European Union's High Representative for foreign policy, analyzing a study by the EU's Intelligence and Situation Centre (EU INTCEN) on the future of the Middle East, due week 9. The group will also make a ten-minute oral presentation; groups not presenting will play roles as members of the High Representative's senior staff, posing questions and offering critiques.

➤ Groups B and C will write the Terms of Reference (i.e., background, scope, and key questions) for a proposed National Intelligence Estimate (NIE), to be presented to the National Intelligence Board chaired by the Director of National Intelligence, due week 11. Each group will also make a ten-minute oral presentation; groups not presenting will play the role of the National Intelligence Board, posing questions and offering critiques.

  o Group B will present the ToR for an NIE on China's "belt and road" initiative.

  o Group C will present the ToR for an NIE on the implications of a "nuclear Iran."

Final Paper (35%) Students will write their final paper in the form of a scenarios paper about a country or issue area (e.g., "Brazil 2040," "Global Energy Futures," or "The EU After Brexit"). Papers should be around 4,000-5,000 words, single-spaced and appropriately sourced. In addition to our discussions of scenario analysis in class, students should consult Peter Schwartz's *The Art of the Long View* (dated, but still the best book on scenario analysis), the "Global Trends" section of the National Intelligence Council website, and the Shell Scenarios website (https://www.shell.com/energy-and-innovation/the-energy-future/scenarios.html).

Alternatively, students may opt to write a case study (ca. 4,000-5,000 words, single-spaced) that illuminates lessons for strategic intelligence and its role in national security policy, whether in the United States or another country. If you have a research topic that you particularly want to pursue, you may also petition to write a traditional research paper in lieu of the scenarios paper.

A brief (2-page, single-spaced) concept paper previewing your final paper, the sources you will use, and the approach you plan to take is due week 10. The paper itself is due December 15.

Oral Contributions (30%) As we will devote most of each session to discussion, the quality of students' participation will be an important component of the final grade. Students are expected to read all the assignments and come to class prepared to discuss them knowledgably. Additionally, each student will give a formal oral presentation on a topic arising from the subject matter under discussion. Grades for participation will be calculated roughly as follows:

      A = regular contributions to class discussion reflecting strong command of the material
      B = regular contributions to class discussion showing good understanding of the material
      C = infrequent contributions to class discussions betraying weak grasp of the material

Course Design

Each weekend, I will post a lesson plan to preview the assignments for the following Thursday, which may include video links as well as assigned readings, and pose questions for you to consider. Except for weeks 3, 6, and 10, when individual assignments are due, we will engage in a brief online discussion via Canvas. Each student will respond to the questions I posed in a short post of 250-500 words. You may post your responses any time up until 6 p.m. on Wednesday (but preferably earlier). After your initial posts, you should read those of your fellow students (which you will not be able to access until you post yours) and make at least one and preferably two additional posts that respond to theirs. The conversation can continue until 8 a.m. on Thursday, so that you can tune in and tune out as your schedule permits.

During class, we will have a 15-minute break, normally halfway through the session, so that you can attend to personal business.

Required Books

- Amy Zegart, *Flawed by Design: The Evolution of the CIA, JCS and NSC* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1999)
- Robert Hutchings and Gregory F. Treverton, eds., *Truth to Power: A History of the U.S. National Intelligence Council* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2019)
- Richard Betts, *Enemies of Intelligence: Knowledge & Power in American National Security* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2007)
- Joshua Rovner, *Fixing the Facts: National Security and the Politics of Intelligence* (Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University Press, 2015)

<div align="center">

Course Outline

</div>

Date   **Topic/Assignments**

9/8   **1. Introduction**

      A case study to get us started:
      - Robert Hutchings, "America at War," in *Truth to Power*, Chapter 5 (pages 105-32)

What is strategy? What is strategic intelligence?
- Williamson Murray, MacGregor Knox, and Alvin Bernstein, eds., *The Making of Strategy* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994), "On Strategy" (pages 1-23)
- Lawrence Freedman, *Strategy: A History* (Oxford; Oxford University Press, 2013), Preface and Chapter 3 (pages ix-xvi and 22-41)
- Richard Betts, *American Force: Dangers, Delusions, and Dilemmas in National Security* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2012), Chapter 10 (pages 232-71)
- Robert Hutchings, "The Future of Strategic Intelligence," *Fletcher Security Review*, Summer 2018, pages 25-8

PART I: STRATEGY

9/15   2. Strategy and Grand Strategy

- Freedman, *Strategy*, Chapters 4, 6, and 7 (pages 42-53 and 69-95)
- John Lewis Gaddis, *On Grand Strategy* (New York: Penguin Books, 2017), Chapter 7 (pages 185-216)
- Hal Brands, *What Good is Grand Strategy?* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2014), Introduction and Conclusion (pages 1-16 and 190-206)
- Walter McDougall, "Can the United States Do Grand Strategy?" *Orbis*, Spring 2010, pages 165-84

Student presentation: Strategy and War
- Gaddis, *On Grand Strategy*, Chapters 1 and 4 (pages 3-27 and 93-119)

Student presentation: The American Way of Strategy
- Michael Lind, *The American Way of Strategy* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006), Chapters 1-2 (pages 3-40)

9/22   3. Planning for the Future in an Era of Uncertainty

- Robert Hutchings, "Is There a Map to the Future?" *Foreign Policy*, August 31, 2011
- Peter Schwartz, *The Art of the Long View*, pages 3-59
- National Intelligence Council, "Mapping the Global Future," Preface and pages 8-45: https://www.dni.gov/files/documents/Global%20Trends_Mapping%20the%20Global%20Future%202020%20Project.pdf
- National Intelligence Council, "Global Trends 2040," pages 1-12 and 90-108: https://www.dni.gov/files/ODNI/documents/assessments/GlobalTrends_2040.pdf

Background reading for first memo assignment:
- "Searching for a Strategy," *Foreign Affairs* (May/June 2019): 10-43
- James Goldgeier and Jeremi Suri, "Revitalizing the U.S. National Security Strategy," *Washington Quarterly*, Winter 2016, pages 35-55.
- The White House, "Interim National Security Strategic Guidance," March 3, 2021

➢ **First memo due by 9:00 a.m.**

9/29   4. Strategic Analysis

- Betts, *Enemies of Intelligence*, Chapter 3 (pages 53-65)
- Derek Beach, *Analyzing Foreign Policy* (London and New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012), Chapters 4-5 (pages 97-148).
- Daniel Kahneman, *Thinking, Fast and Slow* (New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 2011), Chapters 6-9 and 19-21 (pages 71-105 and 199-233)
- Wilhelm Agrell and Gregory F. Treverton, *National Intelligence and Science* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2015), Chapters 1 and 3 (pages 1-10 and 32-54)

Student presentation: Lessons from Scientific Research
- Agrell and Treverton, *National Intelligence and Science*, Chapters 4-5 (pages 55-109)

Student presentation: Planning for "Inevitable Surprises"
- Nassim Nicholas Taleb, *The Black Swan* (New York: Random House, 2010) Prologue and Chapters 10-13 (xxi-xxxiii and pages 137-211)

PART II: THE U.S. NATIONAL SECURITY SYSTEM

10/6   5. The National Security Council

- Amy Zegart, *Flawed by Design*, Introduction and Chapters 1-2 (pages 1-75).
- Bert A. Rockman, America's Departments of State," in Karl Inderfurth and Loch Johnson, eds., *Fateful Decisions: Inside the National Security Council* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004), pages 289-307.

Case Studies: Comparing Foreign Policy Systems
- Excerpts (on Brazil, China, Germany, and the UK) from Robert Hutchings and Jeremi Suri, *Modern Diplomacy in Practice* (London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2020)

Student presentation: Comparing NSC reform proposals from 2000, 2010, and 2016
- https://www.brookings.edu/research/a-new-nsc-for-a-new-administration/
- https://jnslp.com/wp-content/uploads/2010/08/08_Lederman-Master-12-14-09.pdf
- https://issuu.com/atlanticcouncil/docs/a_foundational_proposal_for_the_nex

Student presentation: Comparing Intelligence Services
- Mark M. Lowenthal, *Intelligence: From Secrets to Policy* (Washington, D.C.: CQ Press, 8th Edition, 2020), Chapter 15 (pages 441-99)

10/13 6. The Joint Chiefs of Staff

- Zegart, *Flawed by Design*, Chapters 4-5 (pages 109-62)
- Betts, *American Force*, Chapter 9 (pages 201-31)

Student presentation: OSD (Office of the Secretary of Defense) and the military
- Roger Z. George and Harvey Rishikof, eds., *The National Security Enterprise: Navigating the Labyrinth* (Washington, D.C.: Georgetown University Press, 2nd Edition, 2017), Chapters 6-7 (pages 120-61)

Student presentation: reflections of a Secretary of Defense
- Robert Gates, *Duty: Memoirs of a Secretary at War* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 2014), Chapters 4 and 15 (pages 115-48 and 566-94)

➢ **Second memo due by 9:00 a.m.**

(Fall recess, October 15-23)

10/27 7. The Intelligence Community

- Zegart, *Flawed by Design*, Chapters 7-8 (pages 185-236)
- Robert Hutchings, Introduction to *Truth to Power*, pages 1-22
- Amy Zegart, *Spying Blind: The CIA, the FBI, and the Origins of 9/11* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2007), Chapter 1-2 (pages 1-42)
- Marvin C. Ott, "Partisanship and the Decline of Intelligence Oversight," *International Journal of Intelligence and Counterintelligence* Vol. 16, No. 1 (2003): 69-94
- Optional: Lowenthal, *Intelligence* (8th Edition, 2020), Chapter 3 (pages 37-66)

Student presentation: the intelligence reforms of 2004
- Chapter 13 (pages 399-428) of the 9/11 Commission report: https://govinfo.library.unt.edu/911/report/911Report_Ch13.pdf
- Excerpts from the Intelligence Reform and Terrorist Prevention Act of 2004, Appendix 2 (pages 213-16) of *Truth to Power*
- Michael Allen, *Blinking Red* (Lincoln, NE: Potomac Books, 2013), Chapters1-2 and Epilogue (pages 1-20 and 67-80)

Student presentation: The Newer Players – FBI and DHS
- George and Rishikof, *National Security Enterprise*, Chapters 11-12 (pages 223-80)

PART III. STRATEGIC INTELLIGENCE

11/3 8. The Intelligence-Policy Nexus

- *Truth to Power*, Chapters 1-2 (pages 23-56)
- Betts. *Enemies of Intelligence*, Chapter 1 (pages 1-18)
- Rovner, *Fixing the Facts*, Chapters 1-2 (pages 1-35)
- Sherman Kent, "Words of Estimative Probability," at https://www.cia.gov/static/0aae8f84700a256abf63f7aad73b0a7d/Words-of-Estimative-Probability.pdf

Case Studies
- Gregory F. Treverton, *Unheeded Warning of War: Why Policymakers Ignored the 1990 Yugoslavia Estimate* (Washington: Center for the Study of Intelligence, 2015): https://www.cia.gov/static/75ca22531faf720b31ff82f353d79301/Unheeded-Warning-Yugoslavia.pdf
- Gregory F. Treverton, *The 2007 National Intelligence Estimate on Iran's Nuclear Intentions and Capabilities* (Washington: Center for the Study of Intelligence, 2016): https://www.cia.gov/static/a6c09ab8eb00a08b8ba5ad1a5055f527/2007-Iran-Nuclear-Intentions.pdf

Student presentation: The Other Two Branches – Congress and the Supreme Court
- George and Rishikof, *National Security Enterprise*, Chapters 13-14 (pages 281-322) – on reserve in Stokes Library.

Student presentation: intelligence on the consequences of withdrawal from Afghanistan
- an assessment of intelligence in the six months before the August 2021 withdrawal, based on readily available open-source materials

11/10   9. Politicization

- Betts, *Enemies of Intelligence*, Chapter 4 (pages 66-103)
- Rovner, *Fixing the Facts*, Chapters 3, 4, and 6 (pages 49-136)

➢ **Group memo due by 9:00 a.m. (Group A only)**

11/17   10. Intelligence Failures… and Successes

- Betts, *Enemies of Intelligence*, Chapters 2 and 5 (pages 19-52 and 104-23)
- *Truth to Power*, Chapters 4-6 (pages 85-156) [You need only review Chapter 5, which was assigned reading in Week 1.]

Case Studies
- David S. Robarge, "Getting it Right: CIA Analysis of the 1967 Arab-Israeli War," *Studies in Intelligence* 49, No. 1 (March 2005): https://www.cia.gov/library/center-for-the-study-of-intelligence/csi-publications/csi-studies/studies/vol-62-no-2/pdfs/getting-it-right-1967.pdf
- William Tobey, "Intelligence and Policy Community Cooperation in the Libya WMD Disarmament Case," Occasional Paper 1802, Non-Proliferation Policy Education Center, June 2018

Student presentations: three classic failures assessed
1. Roberta Wohlstetter, "Cuba and Pearl Harbor: Hindsight and Foresight," RAND Memorandum RM-4328-ISA (April 1965): https://www.rand.org/content/dam/rand/pubs/research_memoranda/2007/RM4328.pdf

2. Bruce Riedel, "Enigma: The Anatomy of Israel's Intelligence Failure Almost 45 Years Ago," Brookings Institution Report, September 25, 2017: https://www.brookings.edu/research/enigma-the-anatomy-of-israels-intelligence-failure-almost-45-years-ago;

➢ **Prospectus for final paper due**

(Thanksgiving recess, November 22-27)

12/1 11. The Future of Strategic Intelligence

- *Truth to Power*, Chapter 8, Conclusion, and Appendices 1-2 (pages 180-216)
- Robert Hutchings, "Conclusion," in Hutchings and Suri, *Modern Diplomacy in Practice*, pages 225-35.
- Betts, *Enemies of Intelligence*, Chapters 6-8 (pages 124-93)
- Rovner, *Fixing the Facts*, Chapter 8 and Appendices 1-2 (pages 185-209)
- Anthony Olcott, "Rethinking the Legacy: Strategic Intelligence in the Digital Age," *Studies in Intelligence* 53, No. 2 (2009): https://www.cia.gov/search?q=Olcott&site=CIA&output=xml_no_dtd&client=CIA&myAction=%2Fsearch&proxystylesheet=CIA&submitMethod=get

➢ **Group memos due by 9:00 a.m. (Groups B and C only)**

12/8 12. Course Conclusion and Student Presentations of Scenario Topics

- Readings TBD

Student presentations (2): TBD

➢ **Final paper due December 15**

ADDITIONAL COURSE INFORMATION

Attendance

You are normally expected to attend every class session. If you must miss class because of illness, emergency or other urgent matter, please let me know in advance. If that is not possible, let me know as soon as possible afterward why you missed. If there are things going on that interfere with your ability to complete the readings and assignments, please let me know. You can count on my confidentiality.

Late Work and Extensions

Unless otherwise stated, all deadlines in this course syllabus are firm. Work that is not submitted on time will be subject to a penalty, unless you have contacted me for an extension prior to the deadline.

Academic Integrity

I expect students to understand and observe the University's standards regarding academic integrity. You owe it to yourself, your fellow students, and the institution to familiarize yourself with these standards and observe them. I encourage you to read "Academic Integrity at Princeton," the University's excellent and highly readable handbook on the subject: https://odoc.princeton.edu/sites/odoc/files/Academic%20Integrity%20Booklet%202020-21.pdf

Academic Resources

- **The Writing Center** offers one-on-one conferences with experienced fellow writers trained to consult on assignments in any discipline: http://writing.princeton.edu/center.

- **The McGraw Center** for Teaching and Learning offers one-on-one learning consultations that can be particularly useful for developing active reading strategies, project management skills, and note-taking tactics. You can make an appointment for an individual consultation by visiting their website: https://mcgraw.princeton.edu/.

- **Reference Librarians** can help you make a research plan, find sources (electronic and print) and provide general guidance: http://library.princeton.edu/hours/information.

Mental Health Resources

Students may experience a range of emotional and psychological challenges that can interfere with their learning. Princeton University offers many services to help you through difficult moments. You can learn more about confidential mental health services available at https://uhs.princeton.edu/counseling-psychological-services. Support is available 24-hours-a-day from Counseling and Psychological Services; if your concern is urgent, this link will take you to appropriate care: https://uhs.princeton.edu/counseling-psychological-services/urgent-mental-health-concerns or you can call the Department of Public Safety at 609-258-3333.

Disability Services and Academic Accommodations

Students must register with the Office of Disability Services (ods@princeton.edu; 258-8840) for disability verification and determination of eligibility for reasonable academic accommodations. Requests for academic accommodations for this course should be made at the beginning of the semester, or as soon as possible for newly-approved students. I encourage students with approved accommodations to contact me at the beginning of the semester, and again before major course assessments. Please note that no accommodations for a disability will be made without authorization from ODS, or without advance notice.